

ENFORCEMENT ACTION AGAINST	§	BEFORE THE
PERSIMMONS TOWNHOMES, LTD. WITH	§	TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF
RESPECT TO HOMES AT PERSIMMONS	§	HOUSING AND COMMUNITY
(HTC FILE # 98170 / CMTS # 2026)	§	AFFAIRS
	§	

AGREED FINAL ORDER

General Remarks and official action taken:

On this 25th day of April, 2019, the Governing Board (“Board”) of the Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs (“TDHCA” or “Department”) considered the matter of whether enforcement action should be taken against **PERSIMMONS TOWNHOMES, LTD.**, a Texas limited partnership (“Respondent”).

This Agreed Order is executed pursuant to the authority of the Administrative Procedure Act (“APA”), Tex. Gov’t Code §2001.056, which authorizes the informal disposition of contested cases. In a desire to conclude this matter without further delay and expense, the Board and Respondent agree to resolve this matter by this Agreed Final Order. The Respondent agrees to this Order for the purpose of resolving this proceeding only and without admitting or denying the findings of fact and conclusions of law set out in this Order.

Upon recommendation of the Enforcement Committee, the Board makes the following findings of fact and conclusions of law and enters this Order:

WAIVER

Respondent acknowledges the existence of their right to request a hearing as provided by Tex. Gov’t Code §2306.044, and to seek judicial review, in the District Court of Travis County, Texas, of any order as provided by Tex. Gov’t Code §2306.047. Pursuant to this compromise and settlement, the Respondent waives those rights and acknowledges the jurisdiction of the Board over Respondent.

FINDINGS OF FACT (“FOF”)

Jurisdiction:

1. During 2000, Respondent was awarded an allocation of Low Income Housing Tax Credits by the Board, in an annual amount of \$1,058,204 to build and operate Homes at Persimmons (“Property”) (HTC file No. 98170 / CMTS No. 2026 / LDLD No. 245).

2. Respondent signed a land use restriction agreement (“LURA”) regarding the Property. The LURA was effective December 14, 2000, and filed of record at Volume 2000249, Page 04572 of the Official Public Records of Real Property of Dallas County, Texas (“Records”).
3. Respondent is subject to the regulatory authority of TDHCA.

Compliance Violations¹:

4. Property has a history of violations and previously signed an Agreed Final Order on November 20, 2018, agreeing to a \$500 Administrative Penalty which was to be fully forgivable provided that Respondent complied with the terms of the Order. The Order required submission of work orders for Uniform Physical Condition Standards violations that had been identified during a 2017 inspection. Work orders were submitted and the review was closed, with the administrative penalty deferred and forgiven.
5. On September 28, 2018, TDHCA notified Owner that the Department had received an allegation that Homes of Persimmons had falsified and omitted household income for unit 3202 to qualify them for a low-income unit. Income verification documentation was received as part of the allegation, verifying that the income for this household exceeded the income limit, a violation of 10 TAC §10.611 (Determination, Documentation and Certification of Annual Income) and Section 4 of the LURA, which require screening of tenants to ensure qualification for the program. Accordingly, the Department issued a “household income above income limit upon initial occupancy” finding for unit 3202 and required corrective action to be submitted no later than December 26, 2018. No response was received and the finding was referred for an administrative penalty. A response was submitted by Owner shortly after the administrative penalty referral, and the Department requested tenant file documentation for a replacement household in unit 2305, which had been designated as a replacement unit for unit 3202. A tenant file was submitted by Owner on February 22, 2019, after Enforcement Committee intervention, and the finding was closed by the TDHCA Compliance Division on March 8, 2019.
6. The violation listed above is considered resolved at the time of this Order.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Department has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to Tex. Gov’t Code §§2306.041-.0503, and 10 TAC §2.

¹ Within this Agreed Final Order, all references to violations of TDHCA Compliance Monitoring rules at 10 TAC Chapter 10 refers to the versions of the code in effect at the time of the compliance monitoring reviews and/or inspections that resulted in recording each violation. All past violations remain violations under the current code and all interim amendments.

2. Respondent is a “housing sponsor” as that term is defined in Tex. Gov’t Code §2306.004(14).
3. Pursuant to IRC §42(m)(1)(B)(iii), housing credit agencies are required to monitor for noncompliance with all provisions of the IRC and to notify the Internal Revenue Service of such noncompliance.
4. Respondent violated 10 TAC §10.611 and Section 4 of the LURA in 2018, by accepting a household with income that exceeded prescribed limits upon initial occupancy for unit 3202.
5. Because Respondent is a housing sponsor with respect to the Property, and has violated TDHCA rules, the Board has personal and subject matter jurisdiction over Respondent pursuant to Tex. Gov’t Code §2306.041 and §2306.267.
6. Because Respondent is a housing sponsor, TDHCA may order Respondent to perform or refrain from performing certain acts in order to comply with the law, TDHCA rules, or the terms of a contract or agreement to which Respondent and TDHCA are parties, pursuant to Tex. Gov’t Code §2306.267.
7. Because Respondent has violated rules promulgated pursuant to Tex. Gov’t Code §2306.053 and has violated agreements with the Agency to which Respondent is a party, the Agency may impose an administrative penalty pursuant to Tex. Gov’t Code §2306.041.
8. An administrative penalty of \$500 is an appropriate penalty in accordance with 10 TAC Chapter 2.

Based upon the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, and an assessment of the factors set forth in Tex. Gov’t Code §2306.042 to be considered in assessing such penalties as applied specifically to the facts and circumstances present in this case, the Governing Board of the Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs orders the following:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Respondent is assessed an administrative penalty in the amount of \$500.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent shall pay and is hereby directed to pay the \$500 administrative penalty by cashier’s check payable to the “Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs” on or before (1) May 27, 2019, or (2) the closing date for the pending contemplated sale for this property, whichever is earlier.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the penalty payment must be submitted to the following address:

If via overnight mail (FedEx, UPS):	If via USPS:
TDHCA Attn: Ysella Kaseman 221 E 11 th St Austin, Texas 78701	TDHCA Attn: Ysella Kaseman P.O. Box 13941 Austin, Texas 78711

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent shall follow the requirements of 10 TAC §10.406, a copy of which is included at Exhibit 1, and obtain approval from the Department prior to consummating a sale of the property, if contemplated.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the terms of this Agreed Final Order shall be published on the TDHCA website.

[Remainder of page intentionally blank]

Approved by the Governing Board of TDHCA on April 25, 2019.

By: /s/ J.B. Goodwin
Name: J.B. Goodwin
Title: Chair of the Board of TDHCA

By: _____
Name: James "Beau" Eccles
Title: Secretary of the Board of TDHCA

THE STATE OF TEXAS §
§
COUNTY OF TRAVIS §

Before me, the undersigned notary public, on this 27th day of June, 2019, personally appeared J.B. Goodwin, proved to me to be the person whose name is subscribed to the foregoing instrument and acknowledged to me that he executed the same for the purposes and consideration therein expressed.

(Seal)

/s/ Peggy M. Henderson
Notary Public, State of Texas

THE STATE OF TEXAS §
§
COUNTY OF TRAVIS §

Before me, the undersigned notary public, on this 27th day of June, 2019, personally appeared James "Beau" Eccles, proved to me to be the person whose name is subscribed to the foregoing instrument and acknowledged to me that he executed the same for the purposes and consideration therein expressed.

(Seal)

/s/ Peggy M. Henderson
Notary Public, State of Texas

Exhibit 1

Exhibit 1

Texas Administrative Code

TITLE 10	COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
PART 1	TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY AFFAIRS
CHAPTER 10	UNIFORM MULTIFAMILY RULES
SUBCHAPTER E	POST AWARD AND ASSET MANAGEMENT REQUIREMENTS
RULE §10.406	Ownership Transfers (§2306.6713)

(a) Ownership Transfer Notification. All multifamily Development Owners must provide written notice and a completed Ownership Transfer packet, if applicable, to the Department at least 45 calendar days prior to any sale, transfer, or exchange of the Development or any portion of or Controlling interest in the Development. Except as otherwise provided herein, the Executive Director's prior written approval of any such transfer is required. The Executive Director may not unreasonably withhold approval of the transfer requested in compliance with this section.

(b) Exceptions. The following exceptions to the ownership transfer process outlined herein apply:

(1) A Development Owner shall be required to notify the Department but shall not be required to obtain Executive Director approval when the transferee is an Affiliate of the Development Owner with no new Principals or the transferee is a Related Party who does not Control the Development and the transfer is being made for estate planning purposes.

(2) Transfers that are the result of an involuntary removal of the general partner by the investment limited partner do not require advance approval but must be reported to the Department as soon as possible due to the sensitive timing and nature of this decision. In the event the investment limited partner has proposed a new general partner or will permanently replace the general partner, a full Ownership Transfer packet must be submitted.

(3) Changes to the investment limited partner, non-Controlling limited partner, or other non-Controlling partners affiliated with the investment limited partner do not require Executive Director approval. A General Partner's acquisition of the interest of the investment limited partner does not require Executive Director approval, unless some other change in ownership is occurring as part of the same overall transaction.

(4) Changes resulting from foreclosure do not require advance approval but acquiring parties must notify the Department as soon as possible of the revised ownership structure and ownership contact information.

(c) General Requirements.

(1) Any new Principal in the ownership of a Development must be eligible under §11.202 of Subchapter C (relating to Ineligible Applicants and Applications). In addition, Principals will be reviewed in accordance with Chapter 1, Subchapter C of this title (relating to Previous Participation and Executive Award Review and Advisory Committee).

(2) Changes in Developers or Guarantors must be addressed as non-material amendments to the application under §10.405 of this subchapter.

(3) To the extent an investment limited partner or its Affiliate assumes a Controlling interest in a Development Owner, such acquisition shall be subject to the Ownership Transfer requirements set forth herein. Principals of the investment limited partner or Affiliate will be considered new Principals and will be reviewed as stated under paragraph (1) of this subsection.

(4) Simultaneous transfer or concurrent offering for sale of the General Partner's and Limited Partner's control and interest will be subject to the Ownership Transfer requirements set forth herein and will trigger a Right of First Refusal, if applicable.

(d) Transfer Actions Warranting Debarment. If the Department determines that the transfer, involuntary removal, or replacement was due to a default by the General Partner under the Limited Partnership

Agreement, or other detrimental action that put the Development at risk of failure or the Department at risk for financial exposure as a result of non-compliance, staff may make a recommendation to the Board for the debarment of the entity and/or its Principals and Affiliates pursuant to the Department's debarment rule. In addition, a record of transfer involving Principals in new proposed awards will be reported and may be taken into consideration by the Executive Award and Review Committee, in accordance with Chapter 1, Subchapter C of this title (relating to Previous Participation and Executive Award Review and Advisory Committee), prior to recommending any new financing or allocation of credits.

(e) Transfers Prior to 8609 Issuance or Construction Completion. Prior to the issuance of IRS Form(s) 8609 (for Housing Tax Credits) or the completion of construction (for all Developments funded through other Department programs) an Applicant may request an amendment to its ownership structure to add Principals. The party(ies) reflected in the Application as having Control must remain in the ownership structure and retain Control, unless approved otherwise by the Executive Director. A development sponsor, General Partner or Development Owner may not sell the Development in whole or voluntarily end their Control prior to the issuance of 8609s.

(f) Nonprofit Organizations. If the ownership transfer request is to replace a nonprofit organization within the Development ownership entity, the replacement nonprofit entity must adhere to the requirements in paragraph (1) or (2) of this subsection.

(1) If the LURA requires ownership or material participation in ownership by a Qualified Nonprofit Organization, and the Development received Tax Credits pursuant to §42(h)(5) of the Code, the transferee must be a Qualified Nonprofit Organization that meets the requirements of §42(h)(5) of the Code and Tex. Gov't Code §2306.6706, if applicable, and can demonstrate planned participation in the operation of the Development on a regular, continuous, and substantial basis.

(2) If the LURA requires ownership or material participation in ownership by a nonprofit organization or CHDO, the Development Owner must show that the transferee is a nonprofit organization or CHDO, as applicable, that complies with the LURA.

(3) Exceptions to the above may be made on a case by case basis if the Development is past its Compliance Period/Federal Affordability Period, was not reported to the IRS as part of the Department's Nonprofit Set Aside in any HTC Award year, and follows the procedures outlined in §10.405(b)(1) - (5) of this chapter (relating to LURA Amendments that require Board Approval). The Board must find that:

(A) The selling nonprofit is acting of its own volition or is being removed as the result of a default under the organizational documents of the Development Owner;

(B) The participation by the nonprofit was substantive and meaningful during the full term of the Compliance Period but is no longer substantive or meaningful to the operations of the Development; and

(C) The proposed purchaser is an affiliate of the current Owner or otherwise meets the Department's standards for ownership transfers.

(g) Historically Underutilized Business (HUB) Organizations. If a HUB is the general partner or special limited partner of a Development Owner and it determines to sell its ownership interest, after the issuance of 8609's, the purchaser of that partnership interest or the general or special limited partner is not required to be a HUB as long as the procedure described in §10.405(b)(1) of this chapter (relating to Non-Material LURA Amendments) has been followed and approved.

(h) Documentation Required. A Development Owner must submit documentation requested by the Department to enable the Department to understand fully the facts and circumstances pertaining to the transfer and the effects of approval or denial. Documentation must be submitted as directed in the Post Award Activities Manual, which includes but is not limited to:

(1) A written explanation outlining the reason for the request;

(2) Ownership transfer information, including but not limited to the type of sale, amount of Development reserves to transfer in the event of a property sale, and the prospective closing date;

(3) Pre and post transfer organizational charts with TINs of each organization down to the level of natural persons in the ownership structure as described in §11.204(13)(A) of Subchapter C;

(4) A list of the names and contact information for transferees and Related Parties;

(5) Previous Participation information for any new Principal as described in §11.204(13)(B) of Subchapter C;
(6) Agreements among parties associated with the transfer;
(7) Owners Certifications with regard to materials submitted further described in the Post Award Activities Manual;

(8) Detailed information describing the organizational structure, experience, and financial capacity of any party holding a controlling interest in any Principal or Controlling entity of the prospective Development Owner;

(9) Evidence and certification that the tenants in the Development have been notified in writing of the proposed transfer at least 30 calendar days prior to the date the transfer is approved by the Department. The ownership transfer approval letter will not be issued until this 30 day period has expired;

(10) Any required exhibits and the list of exhibits related to specific circumstances of transfer or Ownership as detailed in the Post Award Activities Manual.

(i) Once the Department receives all necessary information under this section and as required under the Post Award Activities Manual, staff shall initiate a qualifications review of a transferee, in accordance with Chapter 1, Subchapter C of this title (relating to Previous Participation and Executive Award Review and Advisory Committee), to determine the transferee's past compliance with all aspects of the Department's programs, LURAs and eligibility under this chapter and §11.202 of Subchapter C (relating to Ineligible Applicants and Applications).

(j) Credit Limitation. As it relates to the Housing Tax Credit amount further described in §11.4(a) of this title (relating to Tax Credit Request and Award Limits), the credit amount will not be applied in circumstances described in paragraphs (1) and (2) of this subsection:

(1) In cases of transfers in which the syndicator, investor or limited partner is taking over ownership of the Development and not merely replacing the general partner; or

(2) In cases where the general partner is being replaced if the award of credits was made at least five years prior to the transfer request date.

(k) Penalties, Past Due Fees and Underfunded Reserves. The Development Owner must comply with any additional documentation requirements as stated in Subchapter F of this chapter (relating to Compliance Monitoring). The Development Owner, as on record with the Department, will be liable for any penalties or fees imposed by the Department even if such penalty can be attributable to the new Development Owner unless such ownership transfer is approved by the Department. In the event a transferring Development has a history of uncorrected UPCS violations, ongoing issues related to keeping housing sanitary, safe, and decent, an account balance below the annual reserve deposit amount as specified in §10.404(a) (relating to Replacement Reserve Accounts), or that appears insufficient to meet capital expenditure needs as indicated by the number or cost of repairs included in a PCA, the prospective Development Owner may be required to establish and maintain a replacement reserve account or increase the amount of regular deposits to the replacement reserve account by entering into a Reserve Agreement with the Department. The Department may also request a plan and timeline relating to needed repairs or renovations that will be completed by the departing and/or incoming Owner as a condition to approving the Transfer.

(l) Ownership Transfer Processing Fee. The ownership transfer request must be accompanied by the corresponding ownership transfer fee as outlined in §11.901 of this chapter (relating to Fee Schedule, Appeals, and other Provisions).

Source Note: The provisions of this §10.406 adopted to be effective January 5, 2017, 41 TexReg 10569; amended to be effective January 4, 2018, 42 TexReg 7610; amended to be effective December 30, 2018, 43 TexReg 8297